



**STATE OF NEW JERSEY**

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION  
OF THE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of Lisa Williams,  
Assistant Training Supervisor,  
County Welfare Agency (PC0084B),  
Essex County

Examination Appeal

CSC Docket No. 2021-554

**ISSUED: DECEMBER 21, 2020 (SLK)**

Lisa Williams appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) that she did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Assistant Training Supervisor, County Welfare Agency (PC0084B), Essex County.

The education requirement for the subject examination was a Bachelor's degree. The experience requirements were four years of experience in determining training needs, developing training plans and materials, and conducting training programs, or four years of supervisory experience of an income maintenance program or social service program in a welfare agency by the January 21, 2020 closing date. A Master's degree in Social Work could substitute for two years of experience. A total of 20 employees applied for the subject examination and one was found eligible. It is noted that there are two employees serving provisionally in the subject title, including the appellant, and both were found ineligible. Certification PL200988 was issued containing the name of the one eligible and its disposition is due by February 21, 2021. The list expires on November 11, 2023.

On the appellant's application, she indicated that she has Bachelor's degree and a Master's degree in Public Administration. The appellant also indicated that she was provisionally serving in the subject title from December 2019 to the January 21, 2020 closing date, a part-time (25 hours per week) Director of Community Affairs for Zion Hill Church from November 2012 to the January 21, 2020 closing date, a

Family Service Worker from September 2010 to December 2019, a Lead Liaison from September 2015 to January 2019 and a Paralegal from December 2007 to September 2010. Agency Services credited her for having met the education requirement and having two months of experience based on her provisional service in the subject title, but determined that she lacked three years and 10 months of experience.

On appeal, the appellant highlights how she performs the required duties while provisionally serving in the subject title and how her Master's degree in Public Administration helps her perform these duties. Additionally, she presents various training responsibilities that she had while serving as a Family Service Worker and a Director of Community Affairs. She asserts that this background provides her the required experience.

### CONCLUSION

*N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.6(a) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the promotional announcement by the closing date. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:1-1.2(c) provides that the Civil Service Commission (Commission) may relax these rules for good cause in a particular situation, on notice to affected parties, in order to effectuate the purposes of Title 11A, New Jersey Statutes.

Initially, Agency Services correctly determined that the appellant was ineligible as her experience, other than her provisional service in the subject title, was not in positions where training was a primary responsibility, notwithstanding that she performed some training duties in her previous titles. Additionally, the appellant's Master's degree was not in a field that could be substituted for the required experience. On appeal, the appellant explains how she has performed training duties throughout her career. Moreover, the eligible list is incomplete as there is only one name on the eligible list and the appellant has accrued an additional 10 months of applicable experience after the closing date. Further, it is noted that it is anticipated that there shall be a need to fill two positions as there are currently two employees serving provisionally in the subject title. Therefore, although the appellant's background does not precisely mirror the requirements in the subject announcement, the Commission finds good cause under *N.J.A.C.* 4A:1-1.2(c) to accept the totality of her background, for eligibility purposes only, and admit her to the examination.

This determination is limited to the instant matter and does not provide precedent in any other matter.

### ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that the appeal be granted, and Lisa Williams' application be processed for prospective employment opportunities only.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON  
THE 16<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF DECEMBER 2020

*Deirdre' L. Webster Cobb*

---

Deirdré L. Webster Cobb  
Chairperson  
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries  
and  
Correspondence

Christopher S. Myers  
Director  
Division of Appeals  
and Regulatory Affairs  
Civil Service Commission  
Written Record Appeals Unit  
P.O. Box 312  
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Lisa Williams  
Robert Jackson  
Division of Agency Services  
Records Center